



BUNBURY HARVEY
REGIONAL COUNCIL
HARVESTING RESOURCES FROM YOUR WASTE

EVALUATION REPORT - CONFIDENTIAL

Bunbury-Harvey Regional Council Request for Tender – Supply and Delivery of One (1) Dump Truck to Stanley Road Waste Management Facility RFT2021-0003 and Sale of 2012 Hino 500-2628 6 x 4 Tipper

Prepared by: Tony Battersby
Date: 17th November 2020



Contents

Contents.....	2
1. Executive Summary.....	3
2. Background	5
2.1. Title	5
2.2. Contract Overview	5
2.3. Contract Term	5
3. Process	5
3.1. Overview	5
3.2. Pre-Quote Estimate.....	5
3.3. Advertisement.....	6
3.4. Closing Date	7
3.5. Submissions Received	7
4. Evaluation Details	7
4.1. Participants	7
4.2. Evaluation Material.....	7
4.3. Evaluation Process	7
4.4. Evaluation Criteria.....	8
5. Evaluation Summary	8
5.1. Assessment Summary	8
5.2. Compliance Criteria (Supply of Dump Truck).....	8
5.3. Qualitative Criteria (Supply of Dump Truck).....	9
5.4. Compliance Criteria (Outright Purchase of Existing Truck).....	9
5.5. Comparative Price Schedule (Supply of Dump Truck)	10
5.6. Comparative Price Schedule (Outright Purchase of Existing Truck)	10
5.7. Referee Reports	11
5.8. Financial Report/Adverse Risk Report	11
6. Recommended Respondent/s	11
QUALITY & INTEREST	12

1. Executive Summary

The Bunbury-Harvey Regional Council issued a request for tender process to appoint a suitable Contractor/s for the supply of One (1) Dump Truck to be supplied and delivered to the Stanley Road Waste Management Facility. The tender also requests for the trade of existing 2012 Hino 500-2628 6 x 4 Tipper.

It is anticipated that this contract will cost \$335,000.00.

The new supplier contract will cease on acceptance of the goods.

The scope of this request included options for:

- Supply and delivery of the Dump Truck to the Stanley Road Waste Management Facility as per the Specification.
- Training in operation and minor maintenance of the truck.
- Servicing of the truck during the warranty period (at the Principals discretion).
- Purchase of existing 2012 Hino 500-2628 6 x 4 Tipper.

Six (6) tenders were received by the deadline of the request.

One (1) for supply of used Dump Truck and five (5) for outright purchase of existing 2012 Hino 500-2628 6 x 4 Tipper)

Recommendation

That this report is approved and that the company recommended for appointment be offered a Contract subject to contracting and satisfaction of minor variations.

It is further recommended that the CEO be given delegated authority to award the Contract.

Endorsed by:

Tony Battersby
Chief Executive Officer
Bunbury Harvey Regional Council

Evaluation Panel Members:

Tony Battersby
Chief Executive Officer
Bunbury Harvey Regional Council

Jai Pearce
Supervisor
Bunbury Harvey Regional Council

Lisa Stidworthy
Plant Operator
Bunbury Harvey Regional Council

2. Background

2.1. Title

The Bunbury Harvey Regional Council issued a request for tender for a suitable Contractor/s for the supply of one used (1) Dump Truck.

2.2. Contract Overview

The Bunbury Harvey Regional Council requires one (1) used Dump Truck, to be supplied and delivered on site to the Stanley Road Waste Management Facility site in Wellesley, Western Australia.

The vehicle shall be a new arrangement of the latest design in current production and conform to the specification. The vehicle will meet all Australian Standards and any Worksafe WA requirements.

2.3. Contract Term

The new supplier contract will cease on acceptance of the goods.

3. Process

3.1. Overview

For this Request, the proposed timetable of events is as follows:

Task	Date
Tender / Quote Opening and Registration:	21/10/2020
Tender Close:	12/11/2020
Evaluation panel members individually assess submissions:	13/11/2020
Evaluation panel consensus meeting to discuss submissions:	17/11/2020
Clarification/shortlisting process (if required):	17/11/2020
Evaluation report draft prepared:	17/11/2020
Evaluation report finalised and signed off by each panel member:	18/11/2020
Submitted to Council for resolution	26/11/2020

3.2. Pre-Quote Estimate

The Estimated Contract Value (ECV) was \$250,000.00 + GST for supply of used Dump Truck and \$60,00.00 + GST for trade of existing 2012 Hino 500-2628 6 x 4 Tipper.

3.3. Advertisement

The request was advertised in the West Australian on Wednesday, 21st October 2020 and The South Western Times Thursday, 22nd October 2020 and on the Bunbury-Harvey Regional Council website.

ADVERTISEMENT to be placed in The West Australian,
Wednesday 21 October 2020

ADVERTISEMENT to be placed in South Western Times,
Thursday 22 October 2020



BUNBURY HARVEY
REGIONAL COUNCIL
HARVESTING RESOURCES FROM YOUR WASTE

Supply and Delivery of Dump Truck & Trade or Outright Purchase of 2012 Hino 500 – 2628 6 x 4 Tipper

Request for Tender: RFT2021-0003

The Bunbury-Harvey Regional Council is currently seeking tenders from suitably qualified and experienced **Suppliers to supply and deliver of one (1) Used Dump Truck and trade or outright purchase of 2012 Hino 500 - 2628 6 x 4 Tipper** for the Stanley Road Waste Management Facility in Wellesley (Australind).

Tender responses may be lodged by hand to the Bunbury-Harvey Regional Council Administration Office, Lot 45 Stanley Road, Wellesley WA 6233, and must be lodged in time to allow delivery to the tender box by the allotted time or email submission to admin@bhrc.wa.gov.au

Tenders close at: 4:00pm Thursday 12 November 2020.

Documents may be obtained by contacting Taryn York on (08) 9797 2404 or email admin@bhrc.wa.gov.au

For technical and contractual information please contact Chief Executive Officer, Tony Battersby of the Bunbury-Harvey Regional Council on (08) 9797 2404 or by email tbattersby@bhrc.wa.gov.au

Tenders submitted by facsimile will **NOT** be accepted for evaluation, the lowest or any response will not necessarily be accepted.

Canvassing of Bunbury-Harvey Regional Council Councillors or staff will disqualify tenderers from the evaluation process.

Tony Battersby
Chief Executive Officer

3.4. Closing Date

The closing date for submissions was Thursday, 12th November 2020 at 4:00pm (AWST).

3.5. Submissions Received

Six (6) submissions were received. A list of the submissions received is provided in Appendix A.

There were no formal requests for late tenders to be accepted.

4. Evaluation Details

4.1. Participants

The evaluation panel members are listed in the table below. The panel assessed all categories.

Name	Title & Organisation	Role
Tony Battersby	BHRC CEO	Voting
Jai Pearce	BHRC Site Supervisor	Voting
Lisa Stidworthy	Plant Operator	Voting

Declarations were collected from all evaluators for confidentiality and procedural fairness including conflict of interest.

4.2. Evaluation Material

After signing the declaration and prior to the evaluation, each panel member was provided with a list of respondents and reconfirmed there was no conflict of interest. They were then provided with:

- (a) a copy of each submission; and
- (b) An overview of the scoring matrix and process.

4.3. Evaluation Process

The responses were evaluated as follows:

Section(s)	Evaluators
Compliance and Disclosure Criteria	non-weighted
Qualitative Criteria - Relevant Experience	30%
Qualitative Criteria – Technical Capacity (Resources)	40%
Qualitative Criteria – Corporate Social Responsibility	non-weighted
Pricing	30%

The evaluation process consisted of:

- (a) Each panel member individually read and assessed each tender. The assessment was based on the member allocating a score against the selection criterion resulting in an overall score determining their ability to provide the services.
- (b) The panel discussed the tenders and reviewed the technical consultant's advice, and then reached a consensus on the preferred submission.
- (c) Reference checks and financial due diligence on preferred submission was undertaken.
- (d) A recommendation was drafted.
- (e) The evaluation report was endorsed by the Evaluation panel.
- (f) The recommendation was finalised for Council endorsement and approval.

4.4. Evaluation Criteria

The selection criterion utilised in this request consisted of Compliance and Disclosure, Qualitative and a non-weighted pricing assessment.

The Compliance and Disclosure criteria were not point scored and were assessed on a Yes/No basis as to whether the criterion is satisfactorily met. A 'No' statement does not automatically disqualify the response from proceeding through to assessment of the qualitative criteria.

A scoring system was used as part of the assessment of the weighted qualitative criteria. The Evaluation Criteria and scoring system is outlined at Appendix B.

5. Evaluation Summary

5.1. Assessment Summary

A summary statement for the preferred submission is as follows. The summary has been prepared for the purpose of providing feedback and as a brief overview of the principal issues used by the Evaluation Panel to reach a decision on the preferred submission. The summary is not meant to cover all criteria and issues discussed by the Evaluation Panel.

All submissions were processed through to the qualitative/price evaluation on the basis that all compliance criteria had been met for the purposes of assessment.

Minor issues associated with compliance criteria were identified through assessment to be further addressed through resulting shortlisting and contracting. These are detailed in the summary of submissions.

5.2. Compliance Criteria (Supply of Dump Truck)

The submission has complied with the following compliance criteria:

Criteria	Error! Reference source not found.1
Has the submission been signed?	Yes
Is the Price Schedule completed?	Yes
Is a clear legal entity identified? Check for validity. (ASIC check of ABN)	Yes
Do they comply with the Conditions of Tendering?	Yes
Acceptance of terms and conditions of contract and scopes.	Yes
Three Referees provided	Yes
Have the insurance details been completed? Is proof attached?	Yes
Company background/financial provided	Yes

5.3. Qualitative Criteria (Supply of Dump Truck)

The below table provides a comparative qualitative schedule for each of the submissions

Criteria	Error! Reference source not found.1
	Score
1. Relevant Expérience (Weighting 30%)	26%
2. Tenderer's Resources (Weighting 40%)	37%
3.	
4.	
5.	
Total	63%

Tenderer Name	Comments on Qualitative Criteria
Error! Reference source not found.1	Currently operate three CAT manufactured plant.

5.4. Compliance Criteria (Outright Purchase of Existing Truck)

The submission has complied with the following compliance criteria:

Criteria	Error! Reference source not found.2	Error! Reference source not found.3	Error! Reference source not found.4	Error! Reference source not found.5	Error! Reference source not found.6
Has the submission been signed?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Is the Price Schedule completed?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Criteria	Error! Reference source not found.2	Error! Reference source not found.3	Error! Reference source not found.4	Error! Reference source not found.5	Error! Reference source not found.6
Is a clear legal entity identified? Check for validity. (ASIC check of ABN)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Do they comply with the Conditions of Tendering?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Acceptance of terms and conditions of contract and scopes.	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

5.5. Comparative Price Schedule (Supply of Dump Truck)

The below table provides a comparative price schedule for each of the submissions

No.	Criteria	Error! Reference source not found.1
1	Supply and Delivery	\$335,000
2	Training in the Operations	Included in Price
3	One Year Warranty	Not Offered
4	Trade in Value Offered	No Trade Offered
5		
6		
7		
	Total	\$335,000

Tenderer Name	Comments on Price Schedule
Error! Reference source not found.1 – Westrac	\$85,000 over budgeted replacement value.

5.6. Comparative Price Schedule (Outright Purchase of Existing Truck)

The below table provides a comparative price schedule for each of the submissions

No.	Criteria	Error! Reference source not found.2	Error! Reference source not found.3	Error! Reference source not found.4	Error! Reference source not found.5	Error! Reference source not found.6
1	Out-Right Purchase Offered	\$54,545.45	\$36,363.63	\$36,363.64	\$45,000.00	\$62,500.00
2						
3						
4						
	Total	\$54,545.45	\$36,363.63	\$36,363.63	\$45,000.00	\$62,500.00

Tenderer Name	Comments on Price Schedule
---------------	----------------------------

Error! Reference source not found.2 – Forward Motion T/As Bunbury Trucks	\$5,454.55 under budgeted value for purchase of existing truck.
Error! Reference source not found.3 – Manheim Australia	\$23,636.37 under budgeted value for purchase of existing truck.
Error! Reference source not found.4 – Pickles Auctions	\$23,636.37 under budgeted value for purchase of existing truck.
Error! Reference source not found.5 – Smith Boughton	\$15,000.00 under budgeted value for purchase of existing truck.
Error! Reference source not found.6 – Peel Hire Pty Ltd	\$2,500.00 over budgeted value for purchase of existing truck.

5.7. Referee Reports

As part of the evaluation process, referees were contacted for the preferred respondent(s). At least one reference was obtained for each preferred submission. Two referee checks were obtained where an issue was highlighted.

No issues were raised by referees that were of concern to the panel.

5.8. Financial Report/Adverse Risk Report

N/A

6. Recommended Respondent/s

Based on the tender received, the submission received is compliant and met the criteria. Westrac Pty Ltd is the only submission received for the supply of one (1) used Dump Truck the price submitted is \$85,000.00 over the budgeted value and taking into account the surplus of \$2,500.00 for the sale of the existing dump truck leaves a deficit of \$82,500.00. They displayed a wealth of experience in this field local and national.

- Part A That Council accepts the tender RFT2021-0003 submission from Westrac Pty Ltd, 128-136 Great Eastern Hwy, Guildford, WA 6055 for supply of one (1) used CAT 740B Articulated Truck at \$335,000.00 + GST.
- Part B That Council accepts the tender RFT2021-0003 submission from Peel Hire Pty Ltd, PO Box 222, Pinjarra, WA 6208 to purchase of existing 2012 Hino 500 - 2628 Tipper at \$62,500.00 + GST.
- Part C That Council transfer the deficit of \$82,500.00 from the Plant & Equipment Reserve to balance the 2020/2021 BHRC Annual Budget.

TIALITY & INTEREST

Each evaluation panel member is required to complete the following declaration of confidentiality and interest form. Once completed, please provide to the contact person listed on the front cover of this workbook.

Request Number: RFT2021-0003

Request Title: Supply and Delivery of one (1) used Dump Truck & Trade or Outright Purchase of 2012 Hino 500 – 2628 6 x 4 Tipper

I _____ (please print your name) hereby declare that:

- a) I have no pecuniary interest in any of the submissions that have been received for the above named, and that should that situation change; I shall inform the Panel chairperson immediately in writing.
- b) I have no conflict in this evaluation. Should any of the submissions be personally known to me I shall declare such knowledge to the other members of the Evaluation Panel prior to the evaluation process.
- c) I agree to keep all information relating to the evaluation process confidential. Under no circumstances will the details of other submissions be discussed, disclosed or allowed to be discussed to others who may also have a submission.
- d) I shall keep the results of the evaluation process confidential. No indication of the likely recommendation will be discussed, disclosed or allowed to be disclosed without written approval with any party.
- e) I have received copies of all submissions
- f) I shall return all submissions and submitted documents at the completion of the evaluation process.

SIGNATURE: _____ DATE: _____

WITNESS: _____

SIGNATURE: _____ DATE: _____

*If you have any queries in relation to this document please contact person shown on the cover page, **prior** to the Evaluation Panel Meeting*